



Department of Planning, Housing, & Community Development

Mayor, *Richard C. David*
 Director, *Dr. Juliet Berling*

SUMMARY OF MINUTES CITY OF BINGHAMTON COMMISSION ON ARCHITECTURE	
MEETING DATE: April 24, 2018	LOCATION: City Council Chambers, City Hall
CALLED TO ORDER: 12:00 PM	RECORDER OF MINUTES: S. McGee

ROLL CALL	
BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:	BOARD MEMBERS ABSENT:
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ K. Ellsworth (chair) ▪ J. Darrow (vice-chair) ▪ P. Klosky ▪ M. E. Mauro ▪ M. Lombardini ▪ M. Atchie 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ S. Edwards
STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT:	TITLE & DEPARTMENT:
S. McGee	Historic Preservation & Neighborhood Planner, PHCD
T. Konetchy	Planner, PHCD
B. Murphy	Director of Economic Development
N. O'Neil	Assistant Corporation Counsel

APPROVAL OF MINUTES		
MOTION: To approve the January 30, 2018 Regular Meeting Minutes		
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: M. Lombardini	VOTE: PASSED (6-0-0)
AYE(S):	NAY(S):	ABSTENTION(S):
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ K. Ellsworth (chair) ▪ J. Darrow (vice-chair) ▪ P. Klosky ▪ M. E. Mauro ▪ M. Lombardini ▪ M. Atchie 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ None 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ None

SEQR DETERMINATIONS		
ADDRESS: 291 Clinton Street	CASE NUMBER: 2018-26	
DESCRIPTION FROM STAFF REPORT: The applicant, FRGK has proposed the demolition of the building. The applicant has stated that the property was purchased for future business expansion, equipment storage, and parking. An engineering letter has been sent with this report.		
DISCUSSION POINTS: The Commission reviewed all relevant SEQR criteria and found no or small impact for each.		
VOTING		
MOTION: Declare CAUD as Lead Agency and declare the action as UNLISTED for the purposes of historical significance review		
FIRST: K. Ellsworth	SECOND: J. Darrow	VOTE: PASSED (6-0-0)
AYE(S):	NAY(S):	ABSTENTION(S):
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ None 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ None

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ K. Ellsworth (chair) ▪ J. Darrow (vice-chair) ▪ P. Klosky ▪ M. E. Mauro ▪ M. Lombardini ▪ M. Atchie 		
MOTION: Motion to issue a Negative Declaration.		
FIRST: K. Ellsworth	SECOND: J. Darrow	VOTE: PASSED (6-0-0)
AYE(S): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Roll call, all commissioners present in favor of issuing a negative declaration 	NAY(S): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ None 	ABSTENTION(S): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ None

BUSINESS ITEM		
ADDRESS: 37 Court Street		CASE NUMBER: 2018-23
DESCRIPTION FROM STAFF REPORT: The applicant is proposing to remove an existing awning and stretching new awning material over an existing awning frame. The new material for the awning will feature the business name "Parlor City Cards & Collectibles." The new awning material will then be installed on the existing frame. The previous awning was reviewed by CAUD and approved in 2013. A rendering of the proposal was provided with the staff report.		
DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKING: The Commission expressed concern over the material and color of the proposed awning. The Commission discussed different color, material, and design options for the awning.		
PUBLIC COMMENT: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Vince Sartino spoke on behalf of the applicant, Jax Signs, Inc. ▪ No letters received. 		
VOTING		
MOTION: To approve the application and issue a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions: 1) The material of the awning will be composed of either canvas or cloth so as to be consistent with the City of Binghamton Historic Design Guidelines. 2) The color of the awning will be selected from the pre-approved paint colors document. Staff will provide the applicant with the pre-approved paint colors document.		
FIRST: M. Lombardini	SECOND: J. Darrow	VOTE: PASSED (6-0-0)
AYE(S): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ K. Ellsworth (chair) ▪ J. Darrow (vice-chair) ▪ P. Klosky ▪ M. E. Mauro ▪ M. Lombardini ▪ M. Atchie 	NAY(S): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ None 	ABSTENTION(S): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ None
DELIBERATIONS: The Commission discussed the proposed material and color of the awning in accordance with the City of Binghamton Historic Design Guidelines.		

BUSINESS ITEM

ADDRESS: 205 State Street		CASE NUMBER: 2018-24
DESCRIPTION FROM STAFF REPORT: The applicant has proposed the construction of a P. T. deck along the rear of the existing structure. The applicant has stated that deck is consistent with the adjacent establishment rear deck installations.		
DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKING: Phillip Willerton was present and spoke on behalf of the applicant. The applicant indicated that a final color for the proposed deck had not been selected. The applicant indicated egress from the rear deck would not be an issue.		
PUBLIC COMMENT:		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ No letters received. 		
VOTING		
MOTION: To approve the application and issue a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions:		
1) The final paint color of the deck will be selected from the pre-approved paint colors document. Staff will provide the applicant with the pre-approved paint colors document.		
FIRST: M. Lombardini	SECOND: J. Darrow	VOTE: PASSED (6-0-0)
AYE(S):	NAY(S):	ABSTENTION(S):
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ K. Ellsworth (chair) ▪ J. Darrow (vice-chair) ▪ P. Klosky ▪ M. E. Mauro ▪ M. Lombardini ▪ M. Atchie 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ None 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ None
DELIBERATIONS: The Commission discussed the approval of a similar deck at the adjacent property.		

BUSINESS ITEM	
ADDRESS: 135 Washington Street	CASE NUMBER: 2018-25
DESCRIPTION FROM STAFF REPORT: The applicant, Jam135 Ventures, LLC, has proposed the installation of new outdoor café area.	
<p>A rendering of the proposal has been provided below. The café will be delineated on three side by a sectional barrier. A planter will act as the southern leading edge of the café. The applicant provided a site plan and images of the proposed café and barriers. The applicant provided images of the furniture to be utilized in the outdoor café at the meeting.</p>	
DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKING: Mark Yonaty and James Tuttle presented the application.	
<p>K. Ellsworth spoke to the applicant about the café's consistency with the Outdoor Café Design Guidelines.</p> <p>James Tuttle spoke about making the planter shortening the planter to 5 ½ ft so as to provide a minimum 5ft pedestrian clear space between the barrier and the nearest obstruction.</p> <p>K. Ellsworth asked the applicant about the number of table and chairs in the Outdoor Café area will be 6. The table and chairs will be metal and black with a slight gold finish.</p>	
PUBLIC COMMENT:	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ No letters received. 	

VOTING		
MOTION: To approve the application and issue a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions: 1) The planter will be shortened in length to 5 ½ ft. so as to allow for a 5 ft. pedestrian clear space along the public right-of-way.		
FIRST: M. Atchie	SECOND: M. Lombardini	VOTE: PASSED (6-0-0)
AYE(S): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ K. Ellsworth (chair) ▪ J. Darrow (vice-chair) ▪ P. Klosky ▪ M. E. Mauro ▪ M. Lombardini ▪ M. Atchie 	NAY(S): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ None 	ABSTENTION(S): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ None
DELIBERATIONS: The Commission discussed the Café area and the pedestrian clear space.		

BUSINESS ITEM	
ADDRESS: 255 Washington Street	CASE NUMBER: 2018-07
DESCRIPTION FROM STAFF REPORT: The applicant, First Assembly of God, is proposing to install an EMC sign on the property. This sign will replace a monument style sign that was removed after it was vandalized.	
<p>Since the Commission first reviewed the project this past January, the applicant has worked with Planning staff and changes to their initial proposal.</p> <p>The applicant is now seeking review by the Commission for the following items:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Monument style sign with Static LED Display 2. New awning sign 3. Rear wall sign that will replace text signage presently on the building. <p>Images, renderings, and specification sheets of all changes and new proposals were sent with the Staff report.</p>	
DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKING: Eric Olsen, 3i Graphics, was present and spoke on behalf of the application. He informed the Commission that the applicant is seeking a variance from the ZBA for the Static LED Display. Chris Wastrowski also spoke on behalf of the application.	
<p>The Commission asked the applicant about the size of the LED Display.</p> <p>Staff provided the Commission with additional information related to the monument style sign.</p> <p>The Commission asked the applicant about the awning signage, particularly, in regard to the size of the graphics features on the proposed awning sign.</p> <p>The Commission discussed the visibility of the rear façade of the building and whether or not the sign proposed was a “billboard.”</p>	
PUBLIC COMMENT: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ No letters received. 	
VOTING	
MOTION: To approve the application and issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the following items:	

1. Monument Style Ground Sign with Static LED Display. The LED Display area may range from 15% to 35% of the 5x8 ft. sign face, depending on the applicants variance approval by the Zoning Board of Appeals.		
FIRST: M. Lombardini	SECOND: J. Darrow	VOTE: PASSED (6-0-0)
AYE(S): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ K. Ellsworth (chair) ▪ J. Darrow (vice-chair) ▪ P. Klosky ▪ M. E. Mauro ▪ M. Lombardini ▪ M. Atchie 	NAY(S): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ None 	ABSTENTION(S): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ None
MOTION: To approve the application and issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the following items:		
2. Awning sign: The Commission recommends that the graphics and text on the sign be reduced in size by approximately 10%.		
FIRST: M. Lombardini	SECOND: J. Darrow	VOTE: PASSED (6-0-0)
AYE(S): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ K. Ellsworth (chair) ▪ J. Darrow (vice-chair) ▪ P. Klosky ▪ M. E. Mauro ▪ M. Lombardini ▪ M. Atchie 	NAY(S): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ None 	ABSTENTION(S): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ None
MOTION: To table the portion of the application related to the proposed wall sign/billboard on the west façade of the building until further review by staff as to what it constitutes (i.e. wall sign or billboard) and clarification as to whether it is consistent with the City of Binghamton Historic Design Guidelines.		
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: P. Klosky	VOTE: PASSED (6-0-0)
AYE(S): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ K. Ellsworth (chair) ▪ J. Darrow (vice-chair) ▪ P. Klosky ▪ M. E. Mauro ▪ M. Lombardini ▪ M. Atchie 	NAY(S): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ None 	ABSTENTION(S): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ None
DELIBERATIONS: The Commission discussed the monument ground sign in relation to the applicant’s ZBA application. The Commission also discussed the size of the awning signage. The Commission also discussed the proposed rear wall sign and whether or not it could be considered a billboard. The Commission indicated to the applicant that the current proposal didn’t appear to serve any function.		

BUSINESS ITEM	
ADDRESS: 291 Clinton Street	CASE NUMBER: 2018-26
DESCRIPTION FROM STAFF REPORT: The applicant, FRGK Realty, proposed the demolition of the building. The applicant stated that the property was purchased for future business expansion, equipment storage, and parking.	

An engineering letter has been sent with this report.		
DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKING: Jim Zemanik, Rogers Service Group, was present on behalf of the applicant.		
The Commission asked the applicant about the current condition of building and the condition of the property when it was acquired.		
PUBLIC COMMENT:		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ No letters received. 		
VOTING		
MOTION: To issue a Determination of No Historic Significance.		
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: P. Klosky	VOTE: PASSED (5-1-0)
AYE(S):	NAY(S):	ABSTENTION(S):
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ K. Ellsworth (chair) ▪ J. Darrow (vice-chair) ▪ P. Klosky ▪ M. E. Mauro ▪ M. Atchie 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ M. Lombardini 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ None
DELIBERATIONS: The Commission reviewed the Criteria for issuing a Determination of Historic Significance and found that it did not meet any of the three criteria.		

BUSINESS ITEM		
ADDRESS: 103 Moeller Street	CASE NUMBER: 2018-27	
DESCRIPTION FROM STAFF REPORT: The applicant, John G. Donnelly, proposed the demolition of the building on the building.		
DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKING: The applicant was not present at the meeting.		
PUBLIC COMMENT:		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ No letters received. 		
VOTING		
MOTION: To table the application until the applicant is present and provides photographs of the interior.		
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: M. E. Mauro	VOTE: PASSED (6-0-0)
AYE(S):	NAY(S):	ABSTENTION(S):
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ K. Ellsworth (chair) ▪ J. Darrow (vice-chair) ▪ P. Klosky ▪ M. E. Mauro ▪ M. Atchie ▪ M. Lombardini 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ None 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ None

DELIBERATIONS: The Commission discussed tabling the application until the applicant is present and provide interior photographs.		

OTHER BUSINESS		
DESCRIPTION: The Commission discussed the progress made at 47 North Street. J. Darrow asked that staff contact the First Ward Action Council in regard to several properties on Front Street.		
MOTION: N/A		TIME: N/A
FIRST: N/A	SECOND: N/A	VOTE: N/A
AYE(S): N/A	NAY(S): N/A	ABSTENTION(S): N/A

ADJOURNMENT		
MOTION TO ADJOURN		TIME: 1:41 p.m.
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: M. Lombardini	VOTE: PASSED (6-0-0)
AYE(S): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ K. Ellsworth (chair) ▪ J. Darrow (vice-chair) ▪ P. Klosky ▪ M. E. Mauro ▪ M. Lombardini ▪ M. Atchie 	NAY(S): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ None 	ABSTENTION(S): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ None