

Department of Planning, Zoning, & Historic Preservation

SUMMARY OF MINUTES			
THE CITY OF BINGHAMTON			
THE COMMISSION ON ARCHITECTURE & URBAN DESIGN			
MEETING DATE: October 3, 2023 LOCATION: City Hall; 38 Hawley St, Binghamton, NY. 13901			
CALLED TO ORDER: 12:16 p.m. RECORDER OF MINUTES: Dylan Pelton			

ROLL CALL				
COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:	PRESENT:	ABSENT:		
J. Darrow (chair)	X			
M.E. Mauro	X			
D. Nead	X			
R. Heary	X			
D. Whalen	X			
B. Haas	X			
STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT:	TITLE & DEPARTMENT:			
J. Berling	Director, Planning Departme	Director, Planning Department		
S. Patel	City Planner, Planning Depar	City Planner, Planning Department		
D. Pelton	Historic Preservation Planne	Historic Preservation Planner, Planning Department		
Patrick McGinnis	Commissioner of Parks & Re	Commissioner of Parks & Recreation		

APPROVAL OF MINUTES			
MOTION: To approve the minutes as recorded for the September 5, 2023 CAUD meeting			
FIRST: D. Nead SECOND: D. Whalen VOTE: (5-0-1)			
AYE(S): J. Darrow, R. Heary, M.E.	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): B. Haas	
Mauro, D. Whalen, D. Nead			

• Staff suggested naming a new chairperson considering Kenneth Ellsworth's resignation.

VOTING			
MOTION: To appoint John Darrow as chairperson of the Commission on Architecture and Urban Design.			
FIRST: D. Nead SECOND: M.E. Mauro VOTE: (6-0-0)			
AYE(S): J. Darrow, R. Heary, M.E. NAY(S): None ABSTENTION(S): None			
Mauro, D. Whalen, D. Nead, B. Haas			

BUSINESS ITEM		
ADDRESS: 92 Main Street	CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2023-52	
DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA:		

The applicant, Kara Kennedy, would like to change the gas station signs to Citgo as it has changed affiliation.

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKING:

- Applicant states the plans for the gas station.
- Applicant states that they would like to change the sign from Gulf to Citgo as it has changed ownership.

Commissioner states that this is just a change sign for sign to a different gas station advertisement.
 Applicant agrees that it is indeed just a change from one to the other.
 VOTING
 MOTION: To approve of the switch of signage from a Gulf to a Citgo gas station
 FIRST: J. Darrow
 SECOND: R. Heary
 AYE(S): J. Darrow, R. Heary, M.E.
 MAY(S): None
 ABSTENTION(S): None
 Mauro, D. Whalen, D. Nead, B.

BUSINESS ITEM			
ADDRESS: 58 Court Street	CASE N	UMBER: CAUD-2023-55	
DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA: The a	pplicant, Courtside Hospitality, v	would like to install a sign for the business	
above the storefront at 58 Court Stre	et.		
Certificate of Appropriateness			
DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAK	KING:		
 Staff states that the window 	sign was measured and is not m	ore than 1/3 of the total window area.	
 Commissioner askes if the ap 	plicant is installing the header a	bove the entrance as presented.	
 Applicant states he is not sur 	e.		
	VOTING		
MOTION: To approve of the window	sign as presented and sign abo	ve entrance if it is installed as presented.	
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: M.E. Mauro	VOTE: (6-0-0)	
AYE(S): J. Darrow, R. Heary, M.E.	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None	

_		
BUSINESS ITEM		
	DOSINESS IT EIVI	
ADDRESS: 60 Court Street	CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2023-54	

DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA: The applicant, Emma Cheek, would like to install a sign above the business located at 60 Court Street.

Certificate of Appropriateness

Haas

DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKING:

Mauro, D. Whalen, D. Nead, B. Haas

- Applicant states that they would like to install a sign with internally lit channel letters.
- Commissioner asks if the sign conforms to the historic guidelines for the City of Binghamton.
- Staff states that internally lit box letters are generally not accepted.
- Commissioner asks if they could use some other form of illumination for the sign.
- Applicant states that they could do reverse channel letters with halo lighting for illumination.
- Commissioner asks if the pre-existing exterior lights can be used for illumination.
- Applicant states that it is a possibility.
- Case is held over and no motion is given at this time.

BUSINESS ITEM		
ADDRESS: 7 Court Street	CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2023-53	
DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA: The applicant, Adil Ibrar, would like to install a sign and change the awning on the		
facade of 7 Court Street		

Store signs will be:

- Channel Letter Sign
- Aluminum Letter Face
- Vinyl Sticker
- Acrylic Back

Certificate of Appropriateness

DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKING:

- Applicants state that they are opening a restaurant and want to install a sign on the front of the building.
- Applicants state that it will be lit from underneath and have channel lettering.
- Commissioner states the main issue with the sign is the extension of the sign to the second story.
- Applicants ask what guidelines they need to follow for signage.
- Staff responds that CAUD enforces the historic guidelines for the historic district they are in.
- Commissioner states that an awning sign for the chicken logo would be appropriate in a historic district.
- Applicants stated that they also applied to change the awning color.
- Staff stated that the color chosen was on the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette.
- Applicants inquired about changing the angle of the awning.
- Staff stated that the owner of the building has insurance on anything that is over a sidewalk and if the area under the awning stays the same, it wouldn't matter necessarily.
- Applicant asks if there can be art on the awning.
- Commissioner states that any artistic rendering would still have to attain CAUD's approval.
- Commissioner also stated that if you anchor the awning to the building, it has to be anchored at the mortar joints and not directly into the brick of the façade.
- Applicants asked if an approval of the redesigned sign could be done before the next CAUD meeting.
- Staff replied that if a quorum could be reached, yes, hypothetically the sign could be approved outside of the normal commission's calendar.

VOTING			
MOTION: To table the sign's approval for a later date.			
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: D. Whalen	VOTE: (6-0-0)	
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None	

BUSINESS ITEM			
ADDRESS: 30 Front Street (Roberson Mansion) CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2023-44			

DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA: The applicant, Michael Grasso, would like to

- 1. Remove and dismantle existing elements to be replaced
- 2. New metal supports for balustrades
- 3. New fiberglass balustrade replacement at West veranda
- 4. New membrane roofing system to replace flat seam copper at west veranda
- 5. Existing wood window sash repair (Alternate, new storm sash to be added on first and second floor)

Determination of Significance

DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKING:

- Applicant states that he is looking to improve the window and trim of the structure and replace the balustrade on the front entrance.
- Applicant states the current balustrade is not the original and is different from original in rear of building.
- Commissioner asks if the current roof is copper.
- Applicant states that it is, but it is failing, and they would like to replace it with asphalt material.

- Commissioner asks if the copper roof is the original roof.
- Applicant replies that it is not the original copper roof.
- Commissioner asks what the widow repairs will entail.
- Staff replies that there was an administrative review for the window repairs and repainting that was approved prior to the meeting.
- Applicant states that storm windows were included in the plans for the restoration.
- Commissioner asked to see the storm windows.
- Applicant produced architectural plans to commission.
- Commissioner asks if any of the original balustrade remained, or is all of it a reproduction.
- Applicant states that the original to the structure only lasted about 15 years and was only included back to the entrance in the 1990's restoration.
- Applicant states that there is original balustrade to the building in the back that will be the basis for the reproduction.

WOTING MOTION: To approve of the improvements to 30 & 32 Front Street including the balustrade at the main entrance, the window restoration, and the roof membrane repair. FIRST: D. Nead SECOND: R. Heary VOTE: (6-0-0) AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas NAY(S): None ABSTENTION(S): None

BUSINESS ITEM			
ADDRESS: 47 Court Street CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2023-37			AUD-2023-37
	VOTING		
MOTION: To table the case until a later date			
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: M.E. Mauro VOTE: (6-0-0)		
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas	NAY(S): None		ABSTENTION(S): None

BUSINESS ITEM			
ADDRESS: 25 Court Street CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2023-41		AUD-2023-41	
VOTING			
MOTION: To table the case until a later date			
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: R. Heary		VOTE: (6-0-0)
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas	NAY(S): None		ABSTENTION(S): None

BUSINESS ITEM		
CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2023-57		
DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA: The applicant, The Broome County Land Bank Corporation, would like to demolish the garage in the rear of the property located at 52 Beethoven Street.		
Determination of Significance		
 DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKING: Brian Haas is abstaining because the applicant is his wife. 		
,		

 Commissioner asks if there are any plans to build another structure on the site. 			
 Applicant responded that there are none, it will just be parking for the house. 			
	VOTING		
MOTION: To declare CAUD as lead age	ncy		
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: D. Nead	VOTE: (5-0-1)	
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary,	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): B. Haas	
D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro			
	VOTING		
MOTION: To declare demolition as an	unlisted action		
FIRST: J. Darrow SECOND: M. E. Mauro VOTE: (5-0-1)			
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary,	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): B. Haas	
D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro			
VOTING			
MOTION: To find the structure has No Historical Significance.			
FIRST: D. Nead	SECOND: J. Darrow	VOTE: (5-0-1)	
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary,	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): B. Haas	
D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro			

- Staff is looking to save as many viable buildings as possible for future use.
- Staff states that the building at 4 Alfred Street will be demolished to extend the park and for access to and egress from the park.
- Commissioner asks if the park will take the land and use it if the building is demolished.
- Staff states that it will.
- Previous case is revisited with new information for the commission.

BUSINESS ITEM		
ADDRESS: 60 Court Street CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2023-54		
DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA: The applicant, Emma Cheek, would like to install a sign above the business located at		

DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA: The applicant, Emma Cheek, would like to install a sign above the business located at 60 Court Street.

Certificate of Appropriateness

DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKING:

- Applicant states that the file given to the commission was revised and the new file shows a compliant sign with historic regulations.
- Staff states that halo illuminated signs that are flush with the building are acceptable and are compliant with historical sign guidelines.

VOTING			
MOTION: To approve of the revised sign for the façade of 60 Court Street.			
FIRST: R. Heary SECOND: D. Nead VOTE: (6-0-0)			
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas ABSTENTION(S): None ABSTENTION(S): None			

BUSINESS ITEM			
ADDRESS: 4 Alfred Street CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2023-56			
DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA: The applicant, the City of Binghamton, would like to demolish the structure at 4			
Alfred Street.			

Determination of Significance		
DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKING	NG:	
	VOTING	
MOTION: To declare CAUD as lead age	ency	
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: D. Nead	VOTE: (5-0-1)
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary,	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): B. Haas
D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro		
	VOTING	
MOTION: To declare demolition as an	unlisted action	
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: M. E. Mauro	VOTE: (5-0-1)
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary,	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): B. Haas
D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro		
	VOTING	
MOTION: To find the structure has No	Historical Significance.	
FIRST: D. Nead	SECOND: J. Darrow	VOTE: (5-0-1)
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary,	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): B. Haas
D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro		

BUSINESS ITEM		
ADDRESS: 28 Alfred Street CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2023-49		
DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA: The applicant, the City of Binghamton, would like to demolish the structure at 28		
Alfred Street.		
Determination of Significance		
DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKIN	IG:	
VOTING		
MOTION: To declare CAUD as lead age	ncy	
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: D. Whalen	VOTE: (6-0-0)
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary,	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None
D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas		
	VOTING	
MOTION: To declare demolition as an	unlisted action	
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: M. E. Mauro	VOTE: (6-0-0)
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary,	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None
D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas		
	VOTING	
MOTION: To find the structure has No	Historical Significance.	
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: M. E. Mauro	VOTE: (6-0-0)
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary,	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None
D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas		

BUSINESS ITEM		
ADDRESS: 11 Duke Street CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2023-50		

DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA: The app	licant, the City of Binghamton, w	vould like to demolish the structure at 11
Duke Street.		
Determination of Significance		
DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKIN	IG:	
	VOTING	
MOTION: To declare CAUD as lead age	ncy	
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: D. Nead	VOTE: (6-0-0)
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary,	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None
D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas		
	VOTING	
MOTION: To declare demolition as an	unlisted action	
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: R. Heary	VOTE: (6-0-0)
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary,	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None
D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas		
VOTING		
MOTION: To find the structure has No Historical Significance.		
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: M. E. Mauro	VOTE: (6-0-0)
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary, NAY(S): None ABSTENTION(S): None		
D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas		

BUSINESS ITEM			
ADDRESS: 74 Evans Street CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2023-48			
DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA: The applicant, the City of Binghamton, would like to demolish the structure at 74			
Evans Street.			
Determination of Significance			
DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKIN	IG:		
	IITOV	NG	
MOTION: To declare CAUD as lead age	ncy		
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: R. Heary VOTE: (6-0-0)		
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary,	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None	
D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas			
	VOTI	NG	
MOTION: To declare demolition as an	unlisted action		
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: R. Heary	VOTE: (6-0-0)	
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary,	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None	
D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas			
VOTING			
MOTION: To find the structure has No Historical Significance.			
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: M. E. Mau	uro VOTE: (6-0-0)	
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary,	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None	
D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas			

BUSINESS ITEM

ADDRESS: 192 Henry Street		CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2023-46
DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA: The applicant, the City of Binghamton, would like to demolish the structure at 192		
Henry Street.		
Determination of Significance		
DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKIN	IG:	
	VOTII	NG .
MOTION: To declare CAUD as lead age	ncy	
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: R. Heary	VOTE: (6-0-0)
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary,	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None
D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas		
	VOTII	NG .
MOTION: To declare demolition as an	unlisted action	
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: R. Heary	VOTE: (6-0-0)
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary,	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None
D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas		
VOTING		
MOTION: To find the structure has No Historical Significance.		
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: M. E. Mau	vote: (6-0-0)
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary,	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None
D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas		

BUSINESS ITEM		
ADDRESS: 80 Liberty Street CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2023-47		
DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA: The applicant, the City of Binghamton, would like to demolish the structure at 80		
Liberty Street.		
Determination of Significance		
DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKING	IG:	
	VOTII	1G
MOTION: To declare CAUD as lead age	ncy	
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: R. Heary	VOTE: (6-0-0)
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary,	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None
D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas		
	VOTII	NG
MOTION: To declare demolition as an	unlisted action	
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: R. Heary	VOTE: (6-0-0)
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary,	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None
D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas		
	VOTII	NG
MOTION: To find the structure has No	Historical Significand	e.
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: M. E. Mau	uro VOTE: (6-0-0)
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary,	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None
D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas		

BUSINESS ITEM					
ADDRESS: 21 Andrews Street		CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2023-45			
DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA: The applicant, the City of Binghamton, would like to demolish the structure at 21					
Andrews Street.					
Determination of Significance					
DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKIN	IG:				
VOTING					
MOTION: To declare CAUD as lead agency					
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: R. Heary	VOTE: (6-0-0)			
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary,	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None			
D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas					
VOTING					
MOTION: To declare demolition as an unlisted action					
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: R. Heary	VOTE: (6-0-0)			
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary,	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None			
D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas					
VOTING					
MOTION: To find the structure has No Historical Significance.					
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: M. E. Mau	vote: (6-0-0)			
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary,	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None			
D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas					

Other business

- Staff pointed out that there is still an opening on the CAUD commission for another member.
- Chair pointed out that the commission still needs a vice chair that can fill in if he is absent.
 - o D. Whalen volunteered for vice chair.

VOTING				
MOTION: To appoint D. Whalen as vice chair of the Commission on Architecture and Urban Design.				
FIRST: D. Nead	SECOND: M. E. Mauro	VOTE: (6-0-0)		
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None		

o 7 Court Street may ask for a special session to approve of a redesigned sign. If a quorum can be generated, a vote can occur, and a motion can be adopted.

VOTING				
MOTION: To adjourn this session of the CAUD commission.				
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: R. Heary	VOTE: (6-0-0)		
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, R. Heary,	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None		
D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas				