



# Department of Planning, Zoning, & Historic Preservation

SUMMARY OF MINUTES THE CITY OF BINGHAMTON THE COMMISSION ON ARCHITECTURE & URBAN DESIGN	
<b>MEETING DATE:</b> July 2, 2024	<b>LOCATION:</b> City Hall; 38 Hawley St, Binghamton, NY. 13901
<b>CALLED TO ORDER:</b> 12:15 p.m.	<b>RECORDER OF MINUTES:</b> Dylan Pelton

ROLL CALL		
COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:	PRESENT:	ABSENT:
J. Darrow (chair)	X	
M.E. Mauro	X	
D. Nead	X	
J. Weissberg	X	
D. Whalen	X	
B. Haas	X	
STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT:	TITLE & DEPARTMENT:	
J. Berling	Director, Planning Department	
S. Patel	City Planner, Planning Department	
D. Pelton	Historic Preservation Planner, Planning Department	
R. Heary	Corporate Council	
N. Ballard	Parks & Recreation Department	

APPROVAL OF MINUTES		
<b>MOTION:</b> To approve the minutes as recorded for the June 4, 2024 CAUD meeting		
<b>FIRST:</b> J. Darrow	<b>SECOND:</b> D. Nead	<b>VOTE:</b> (5-0-0)
<b>AYE(S):</b> J. Darrow, B. Hass, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro	<b>NAY(S):</b> None	<b>ABSTENTION(S):</b> None

- Announcement of public meeting

BUSINESS ITEM	
<b>ADDRESS:</b> 183 Water Street	<b>CASE NUMBER:</b> CAUD-2024-18
<b>DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA:</b> The applicant, the City of Binghamton, would like to install exterior lights and exterior panels on the new Parking Garage.	
<b>Certificate of Appropriateness</b>	
<b>DISCUSSION POINTS &amp; THOSE SPEAKING:</b>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Representative states that the pre-cast building is in place and this is a chance for the City of Binghamton to add some aesthetic character to the building’s exterior.</li> <li>• Representative stated that there are columns at the top that are capped and the proposed screening would shield those and add to the overall aesthetic to the building.</li> </ul>	

- Johnathan Weisberg joins the commission.

- Commissioner states he is very partial to what is presented.
- Commissioner states that the broken up façade is an interesting element to the presentation.
- Commissioner states that it is much more aesthetically pleasing than just the pre-cast ramp.

<b>VOTING</b>		
<b>MOTION: To approved of the installation of exterior lights and exterior panels on the new Parking Garage as presented.</b>		
<b>FIRST: B. Haas</b>	<b>SECOND: J. Darrow</b>	<b>VOTE: (6-0-0)</b>
<b>AYE(S): J. Darrow, B. Hass, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro</b>	<b>NAY(S): None</b>	<b>ABSTENTION(S): None</b>

<b>BUSINESS ITEM</b>	
<b>ADDRESS: 191 Court Street</b>	<b>CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2024-25</b>
<b>DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA:</b> The applicant, Jennifer Corby, would like to replace the side deck and stairs “in kind” using the same dimensions and paint colors as the original structure.	
<b>Certificate of Appropriateness</b>	
<b>DISCUSSION POINTS &amp; THOSE SPEAKING:</b>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Staff states that the stairs and the deck have to be replaced “in kind” because the stairs and the deck are formed around the railings that were made in the late 1800’s and have certain dimensions that must be replicated.</li> <li>• Applicant states that they are going to reproduce what is there and are simply going to replicate the stairway as it is.</li> </ul>	

<b>VOTING</b>		
<b>MOTION: To approved of the repair of the porch “in kind” as presented for the 191 Court Street building.</b>		
<b>FIRST: J. Darrow</b>	<b>SECOND: J. Weissberg</b>	<b>VOTE: (6-0-0)</b>
<b>AYE(S): J. Darrow, B. Hass, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro</b>	<b>NAY(S): None</b>	<b>ABSTENTION(S): None</b>

<b>BUSINESS ITEM</b>	
<b>ADDRESS: 60 Morgan Road</b>	<b>CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2024-26</b>
<b>DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA:</b> The applicant, the City of Binghamton, would like to build a new shelter to house the Ross Park Carousel similar to the original shelter built in 1922.	
<b>Certificate of Appropriateness</b>	
<b>DISCUSSION POINTS &amp; THOSE SPEAKING:</b>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Staff states that they are under obligation by the NYS SHPO office to redesign the new structure to appear as the original structure.</li> <li>• Staff explains that the new structure would be located outside of the primary fence of the zoo, therefore, it would need some kind of enclosure to protect it from possible vandalism.</li> </ul>	

- Commissioner asks if there was anything around the carousel in the past because he seemed to remember glass or some other enclosure for the carousel.
- Staff replied that the only pictures it had were of the enclosure as it is without any kind of exterior covering for the interior.
- Staff added that SHPO asked us not to enclose it or weatherize it as it would not be historically accurate to the original shelter.
- Staff explained that this design calls for the windows to be invisible to the eye when they are up so as not to stray too far from the original design.
- Commissioner asks if the doors will be able to retract given that they are at an angle towards each other.
- Commissioner asks if it would be possible to add an arched window or paint the exterior of the doors to be more aesthetically pleasing.
- Staff explains that the carousel is being presented as close to the original as possible and any differences can be discussed at a later date.
- Commissioner asks if the people on the carousel will be able to see the doors when they are riding it.
- Staff replies they should be out of sight as it was part of the agreement with SHPO.
- Commissioner states that any changes to the final design would have to come back to the CAUD commission for approval.

<b>VOTING</b>		
<b>MOTION: To approved of the shelter for the carousel as presented pending any design changes in the future.</b>		
<b>FIRST: J. Darrow</b>	<b>SECOND: J. Weissberg</b>	<b>VOTE: (6-0-0)</b>
<b>AYE(S): J. Darrow, B. Hass, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro</b>	<b>NAY(S): None</b>	<b>ABSTENTION(S): None</b>

<b>BUSINESS ITEM</b>	
<b>ADDRESS: 7 Livingston Street</b>	<b>CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2024-17</b>
<b>DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA:</b> The applicant, Michael Meagher, would like to demolish the structure at 7 Livingston Street.	
<b>Determination of Historical Significance for Demolition</b>	
<b>DISCUSSION POINTS &amp; THOSE SPEAKING:</b>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Staff presents a rendering of what the diocese wants to do with the space once the convent is demolished.</li> <li>• Staff replies that the space will be an unfenced in yard in front of the school.</li> <li>• Commissioner states that they may want some hedges in front of the property to keep the playground in the distance more private.</li> <li>• Commissioner states that they may want a fence to the south where there is a drop off.</li> <li>• Applicant states that there is no drop off and the land is actually quite flat, it just happens to look like it in the rendering.</li> </ul>	

<b>VOTING</b>		
<b>MOTION: To declare CAUD as lead agency.</b>		
<b>FIRST: J. Darrow</b>	<b>SECOND: D. Whalen</b>	<b>VOTE: (6-0-0)</b>

<b>AYE(S): J. Darrow, B. Hass, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro</b>	<b>NAY(S): None</b>	<b>ABSTENTION(S): None</b>
--	---------------------	----------------------------

<b>VOTING</b>		
<b>MOTION: To declare demolition as an unlisted action.</b>		
<b>FIRST: J. Darrow</b>	<b>SECOND: J. Weissberg</b>	<b>VOTE: (6-0-0)</b>
<b>AYE(S): J. Darrow, B. Hass, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro</b>	<b>NAY(S): None</b>	<b>ABSTENTION(S): None</b>

<b>VOTING</b>		
<b>MOTION: To approve of the demolition of 7 Livingston Street.</b>		
<b>FIRST: D. Nead</b>	<b>SECOND: M. E. Mauro</b>	<b>VOTE: (6-0-0)</b>
<b>AYE(S): J. Darrow, B. Hass, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro</b>	<b>NAY(S): None</b>	<b>ABSTENTION(S): None</b>

- Brian Haas recuses himself as his wife is the executive director for the Broome County Land Bank Corporation.

<b>BUSINESS ITEM</b>	
<b>ADDRESS: 8 Gray Street</b>	<b>CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2024-23</b>
<b>DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA:</b> The applicant, Broome County Land Bank Corporation, would like to demolish the accessory structure at 8 Gray Street.	
<b>Determination of Historical Significance for Demolition</b>	
<b>DISCUSSION POINTS &amp; THOSE SPEAKING:</b>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Applicant states that the Land Bank acquired both 8 Gray Street and 170 Moeller Street properties for rehabilitation and the garage structures on both are too dilapidated to rehabilitate.</li> <li>• Applicant states that the garage at 8 Gray Street has a significant lean and the roof of the garage at 170 Moeller Street is at least ½ collapsed in on itself.</li> <li>• Commissioner asks what plans are being made for the space once the garages are demolished.</li> <li>• Applicant states that no permanent plan has been established to either rebuild the garage or leave the space as greenspace or parking.</li> <li>• Staff asks if there are any post use considerations.</li> <li>• Applicant states that currently there are firms working on the site plans for the buildings rehabilitations.</li> <li>• Commissioner asks what plans are being made for the footprint of the garages.</li> <li>• Commissioner asks if we could proceed considering the safety issues with the structures without a post use plan.</li> <li>• Staff states that we can.</li> <li>• Staff reminds the commission that both addresses need separate hearings.</li> </ul>	

VOTING		
<b>MOTION: To declare CAUD as lead agency.</b>		
<b>FIRST: J. Darrow</b>	<b>SECOND: J. Weissberg</b>	<b>VOTE: (5-0-1)</b>
<b>AYE(S): J. Darrow, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro</b>	<b>NAY(S): None</b>	<b>ABSTENTION(S): B. Haas</b>

VOTING		
<b>MOTION: To declare demolition as an unlisted action.</b>		
<b>FIRST: J. Darrow</b>	<b>SECOND: D. Whalen</b>	<b>VOTE: (5-0-1)</b>
<b>AYE(S): J. Darrow, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro</b>	<b>NAY(S): None</b>	<b>ABSTENTION(S): B. Haas</b>

VOTING		
<b>MOTION: To approve the demolition of the accessory structure at 8 Gray Street.</b>		
<b>FIRST: D. Nead</b>	<b>SECOND: J. Darrow</b>	<b>VOTE: (5-0-1)</b>
<b>AYE(S): J. Darrow, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro</b>	<b>NAY(S): None</b>	<b>ABSTENTION(S): B. Haas</b>

- Commissioner states that parking space is there after demolition, but if anything else is being built in it's footprint, the commission would have to approve of the structure.

BUSINESS ITEM	
<b>ADDRESS: 170 Moeller Street</b>	<b>CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2024-22</b>
<b>DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA:</b> The applicant, Broome County Land Bank Corporation, would like to demolish a garage on the back of the property located at 170 Moeller Street.	
<b>Determination of Historical Significance for Demolition</b>	
<b>DISCUSSION POINTS &amp; THOSE SPEAKING:</b>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Applicant states that SHPO has already determined that the building is not significant and no employees have entered the structure due to safety concerns.</li> <li>• Commissioner states that is likely for the best.</li> <li>• Staff states that there is no asphalt under the structure, and it is not a garage but rather just an outbuilding.</li> </ul>	

VOTING		
<b>MOTION: To declare CAUD as lead agency.</b>		
<b>FIRST: J. Darrow</b>	<b>SECOND: J. Weissberg</b>	<b>VOTE: (5-0-1)</b>
<b>AYE(S): J. Darrow, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro</b>	<b>NAY(S): None</b>	<b>ABSTENTION(S): B. Haas</b>

<b>VOTING</b>		
<b>MOTION: To declare demolition as an unlisted action.</b>		
<b>FIRST: J. Darrow</b>	<b>SECOND: J. Weissberg</b>	<b>VOTE: (5-0-1)</b>
<b>AYE(S): J. Darrow, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro</b>	<b>NAY(S): None</b>	<b>ABSTENTION(S): B. Haas</b>

<b>VOTING</b>		
<b>MOTION: To approve the demolition of the accessory structure at 170 Moeller Street.</b>		
<b>FIRST: D. Nead</b>	<b>SECOND: J. Darrow</b>	<b>VOTE: (5-0-1)</b>
<b>AYE(S): J. Darrow, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro</b>	<b>NAY(S): None</b>	<b>ABSTENTION(S): B. Haas</b>

- Commissioner states that the house may have been constructed between 1830 – 1840 and is likely one of the original farmhouses on that side of town.
- Applicant states that it is the intention of the Land Bank to fully restore the home.
- B. Haas seeks to end his recusal and return to the commission.
- Chairperson recognized B. Hass as back on the CAUD commission.

<b>BUSINESS ITEM</b>	
<b>ADDRESS: 9 Bayless Avenue</b>	<b>CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2024-24</b>
<b>DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA:</b> The applicant, Kathleen Kellogg, would like to demolish the fire damaged property to rebuild in the same location.	
<b>Determination of Historical Significance for Demolition</b>	
<b>DISCUSSION POINTS &amp; THOSE SPEAKING:</b>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Commissioner states that the meeting today is for the demolition but plans may have to be approved for construction.</li> <li>• Applicant states that would be up to the owner.</li> </ul>	

<b>VOTING</b>		
<b>MOTION: To declare CAUD as lead agency.</b>		
<b>FIRST: J. Darrow</b>	<b>SECOND: M. E. Mauro</b>	<b>VOTE: (6-0-0)</b>
<b>AYE(S): J. Darrow, B. Hass, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro</b>	<b>NAY(S): None</b>	<b>ABSTENTION(S): None</b>

<b>VOTING</b>		
<b>MOTION: To declare demolition as an unlisted action.</b>		
<b>FIRST: J. Darrow</b>	<b>SECOND: M. E. Mauro</b>	<b>VOTE: (6-0-0)</b>
<b>AYE(S): J. Darrow, B. Hass, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro</b>	<b>NAY(S): None</b>	<b>ABSTENTION(S): None</b>

<b>VOTING</b>		
<b>MOTION: To approve of the demolition of 9 Bayless Avenue.</b>		
<b>FIRST: D. Nead</b>	<b>SECOND: J. Darrow</b>	<b>VOTE: (6-0-0)</b>
<b>AYE(S): J. Darrow, B. Hass, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro</b>	<b>NAY(S): None</b>	<b>ABSTENTION(S): None</b>

<b>BUSINESS ITEM</b>	
<b>ADDRESS: 17 Jackson Street</b>	<b>CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2024-21</b>
<b>DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA:</b> The applicant, James Torto, would like to demolish the structure at 17 Jackson Street.	
<b>Determination of Historical Significance for Demolition</b>	
<b>DISCUSSION POINTS &amp; THOSE SPEAKING:</b>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Staff states that the applicant has to be reached by phone.</li> <li>• Commissioner states that in the interest of full disclosure, James Torto was a tenant of his in the mid-nineties.</li> <li>• Commissioner states that looking at the house there seems to be some health and safety issues.</li> <li>• Applicant states that there are some foundation issues as well as other structural issues with the house.</li> <li>• Staff asks if there is a post use plan for the property.</li> <li>• Applicant states that there are some possibilities since his construction company owns the surrounding property, but for the time being it would remain a vacant lot for future development.</li> <li>• Staff clarifies that the lot would be considered greenspace and would not be developed until a plan was completed.</li> </ul>	

<b>VOTING</b>		
<b>MOTION: To declare CAUD as lead agency.</b>		
<b>FIRST: J. Darrow</b>	<b>SECOND: D. Nead</b>	<b>VOTE: (6-0-0)</b>
<b>AYE(S): J. Darrow, B. Hass, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro</b>	<b>NAY(S): None</b>	<b>ABSTENTION(S): None</b>

<b>VOTING</b>		
<b>MOTION: To declare demolition as an unlisted action.</b>		
<b>FIRST: J. Darrow</b>	<b>SECOND: J. Weissberg</b>	<b>VOTE: (6-0-0)</b>
<b>AYE(S): J. Darrow, B. Hass, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro</b>	<b>NAY(S): None</b>	<b>ABSTENTION(S): None</b>

<b>VOTING</b>		
<b>MOTION: To approve of the demolition of 17 Jackson Street</b>		
<b>FIRST: D. Nead</b>	<b>SECOND: J. Darrow</b>	<b>VOTE: (6-0-0)</b>
<b>AYE(S): J. Darrow, B. Hass, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro</b>	<b>NAY(S): None</b>	<b>ABSTENTION(S): None</b>

- Other Business
  - Applicant for 33 S. Washington Street approaches, however no application is on file for the address.
  - Applicant states that she was told if she applied by a certain date, she would be on the next CAUD meeting agenda.
  - Staff states that although the case is recognizable, no application can be found in the case file or in an email attachment.
  - Applicant states that they are working with Matzo signs.
  - Commissioner asks if the firefighter pole and railing are still in the building.
  - Applicant states that they have been removed.
  - Commissioner asks what the applicant’s business does.
  - Applicant states that it is an apparel store and a beauty boutique as well.
  - Commissioner states that although there is no application on our agenda, we could hold a special session once an application is obtained.
  - Staff shows a rendering of the sign on the front as well as the side of the building.
  - Commissioner again states that a motion cannot be made without an application on file.
  - Staff asks if a discussion or a straw pole could be done.
  - Commissioner states that without an application, it will just have to be heard again.
  - Commissioner tells applicant that a staff report will be generated and the case can be heard at a special session or it will be heard in the August meeting.
  - Staff asks if there are any issues with the sign, are the colors on the historic color palette.
  - Commissioner states that applicant may want to consider colors given that he cannot read some elements of the sign.
  - The commissioner states that the Hemingway House on Walnut Street has lost some of the original fencing that surrounds the property and it is in need of repair.
  - Also that the porch on the old Parson’s Funeral Home is in decline and needs to be repaired.
  - Staff states that ownership of the building is in question and reaching the current owners may be difficult.
  - Staff states that the use of the building is not known at this time.
  - Commissioner asks about the ownership of the Masonic Temple.
  - Staff states that the building is included in the case following Isaac Anzaroot’s incarceration and ownership of that property, as well as other buildings, is not known at this time.

<b>VOTING</b>		
<b>MOTION: To adjourn the July meeting of the CAUD commission to a close.</b>		
<b>FIRST: J. Darrow</b>	<b>SECOND: M. E. Mauro</b>	<b>VOTE: (6-0-0)</b>
<b>AYE(S): J. Darrow, B. Hass, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro</b>	<b>NAY(S): None</b>	<b>ABSTENTION(S): None</b>