



LEGISLATIVE BRANCH ▪ CITY OF BINGHAMTON

Hadassah Mativetsky, City Council President

Sarah Dinhofer, City Clerk

COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF BINGHAMTON

Budget Hearing #6 Minutes

City Council Chambers, 38 Hawley Street, Binghamton, NY 13901

6:00 PM Thursday, October 17, 2024

I. CALL TO ORDER

At 6:03PM by Chair Cavanaugh

II. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Led by Chair Cavanaugh

III. ROLL CALL

Present: Porter, Middleton, Cavanaugh, Hotchkiss, Mativetsky, Kosty

Absent: Dundon

Also Present: Sarah Dinhofer (City Clerk), Sophie Bergman (Corporation Counsel), Charles Robinson (Comptroller)

IV. BUDGET REVIEW WITH DEPARTMENT HEADS

a. Parking Budget Presented by Representative

i. Chair Cavanaugh opened page(s) 136-150, 231-232 (Parking Ramps)

1. Motion to amend 7 Hawley St Parking Ramp Hourly Rate fee for "2 hour or less (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)" to "Each additional hour (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)" at \$1 on page 231: Cavanaugh
 - a. Second: Middleton
 - b. Vote: 5-1-0-1
 - c. Nay: Kosty
 - d. Absent: Dundon
2. Motion to remove 7 Hawley St Parking Ramp Hourly Rate fees for "3 hour or less (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)", "4 hour or less (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)", "5 hour or less (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)", "6 hour or less (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)", "7 hour or less (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)", "8 hour or less (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)" on page 231: Cavanaugh
 - a. Second: Hotchkiss
 - b. Vote: 5-1-0-1
 - c. Nay: Kosty
 - d. Absent: Dundon
3. Motion to amend State St Parking Ramp Hourly Rate fee for "2 hour or less (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)" to "Each additional hour (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)" at \$1 on page 231: Cavanaugh
 - a. Second: Hotchkiss
 - b. Vote: 5-1-0-1
 - c. Nay: Kosty
 - d. Absent: Dundon



LEGISLATIVE BRANCH ▪ CITY OF BINGHAMTON

Hadassah Mativetsky, City Council President

Sarah Dinhofer, City Clerk

4. Motion to remove State St Parking Ramp Hourly Rate fees for “3 hour or less (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)”, “4 hour or less (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)”, “5 hour or less (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)”, “6 hour or less (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)”, “7 hour or less (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)”, “8 hour or less (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)” on page 231: Cavanaugh
 - a. Second: Hotchkiss
 - b. Vote: 5-1-0-1
 - c. Nay: Kosty
 - d. Absent: Dundon
5. Motion to amend Water St Parking Ramp Hourly Rate fee for “2 hour or less (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)” to “Each additional hour (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)” at \$1 on page 232: Cavanaugh
 - a. Second: Hotchkiss
 - b. Vote: 5-1-0-1
 - c. Nay: Kosty
 - d. Absent: Dundon
6. Motion to remove Water St Parking Ramp Hourly Rate fees for “3 hour or less (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)”, “4 hour or less (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)”, “5 hour or less (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)”, “6 hour or less (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)”, “7 hour or less (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)”, “8 hour or less (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)” on page 232: Cavanaugh
 - a. Second: Hotchkiss
 - b. Vote: 5-1-0-1
 - c. Nay: Kosty
 - d. Absent: Dundon
7. Motion to amend Water St Parking Ramp Hourly Rate fee for “1 hour or less (7am-5pm M-F)” to “1 hour or less (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)” on page 232: Cavanaugh
 - a. Second: Middleton
 - b. Vote: 5-1-0-1
 - c. Nay: Kosty
 - d. Absent: Dundon
8. Motion to amend State St Parking Ramp Hourly Rate fee for “1 hour or less (7am-5pm M-F)” to “1 hour or less (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)” on page 231: Cavanaugh
 - a. Second: Middleton
 - b. Vote: 5-1-0-1
 - c. Nay: Kosty
 - d. Absent: Dundon
9. Motion to amend Water St Parking Ramp Monthly Rate fee for “Regular Monthly Permit” to \$15 on page 232: Cavanaugh
 - a. Second: Middleton
 - b. Vote: 5-1-0-1
 - c. Nay: Kosty
 - d. Absent: Dundon



LEGISLATIVE BRANCH ▪ CITY OF BINGHAMTON

Hadassah Mativetsky, City Council President

Sarah Dinhofer, City Clerk

10. Motion to remove Water St Parking Ramp fee for “Late Night (after 9:30pm, Friday, & Saturday after 8pm)” on page 232: Cavanaugh
 - a. Second: Hotchkiss
 - b. Vote: 5-1-0-1
 - c. Nay: Kosty
 - d. Absent: Dundon
11. Motion to amend Collier St surface lot hourly rate fee for “2 hours or less (7am-7pm M-F)” to “Each additional hour (7am Monday to 7pm Friday)” at \$1 on page 232: Cavanaugh
 - a. Second: Hotchkiss
 - b. Vote: 5-1-0-1
 - c. Nay: Kosty
 - d. Absent: Dundon
12. Motion to remove Collier St surface lot hourly rate fees for “3 hours or less (7am-7pm M-F)”, “4 hours or less (7am-7pm M-F)”, “5 hours or less (7am-7pm M-F)”, “6 hours or less (7am-7pm M-F)”, “7 hours or less (7am-7pm M-F)”, “8 hours or less (7am-7pm M-F)” on page 232: Cavanaugh
 - a. Second: Hotchkiss
 - b. Vote: 5-1-0-1
 - c. Nay: Kosty
 - d. Absent: Dundon
13. Motion to amend State St Parking Ramp Hourly Rate fee for “Ticket max per day (7am-5pm M-F)” to “Ticket max per day (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)” at \$1 on page 231: Cavanaugh
 - a. Second: Hotchkiss
 - b. Vote: 5-1-0-1
 - c. Nay: Kosty
 - d. Absent: Dundon
14. Motion to amend Water St Parking Ramp Hourly Rate fee for “Ticket max per day (7am-5pm M-F)” to “Ticket max per day (6am Monday to 6am Sunday)” at \$1: Cavanaugh
 - a. Second: Hotchkiss
 - b. Vote: 4-2-0-1
 - c. Nay: Porter, Kosty
 - d. Absent: Dundon
15. Motion to close page(s) 136-150, 231 (Parking Ramps) *as amended*, 232 (Parking Ramps) *as amended*: Middleton
 - a. Second: Hotchkiss
 - b. Vote: 6-0-0-1
 - c. Nay: Kosty
 - d. Absent: Dundon

b. Library Budget Presented by Library Director

- i. Chair Cavanaugh opened page(s) 95
 1. Motion to close page(s) 95: Kosty



LEGISLATIVE BRANCH ▪ CITY OF BINGHAMTON

Hadassah Mativetsky, City Council President

Sarah Dinhofer, City Clerk

- a. Second: Mativetsky
- b. Vote: 6-0-0-1
- c. Absent: Dundon

c. Information Management & Technology Budget Presented by IT Manager

- i. Chair Cavanaugh opened page(s) 36, 49-50, 225 (Information Technology)
 - 1. Motion to close page(s) 36, 49-50, 225 (Information Technology): Kosty
 - a. Second: Middleton
 - b. Vote: 6-0-0-1
 - c. Absent: Dundon

d. Bonds, Bans, Capital, Retirement, Etc. & Any Call Back Pages of Budget Presented by Comptroller

- i. Chair Cavanaugh opened page(s) 3-6, 26, 35, 51, 53, 77, 81-82, 103, 109-122, 223-225
 - 1. Motion to amend page 3 to move \$250,00 currently reflected in reserves to fund balance column: Cavanaugh
 - a. Second: Mativetsky
 - b. Vote: 6-0-0-1
 - c. Absent: Dundon
 - 2. Motion to close page(s) page(s) 3 *as amended*, 4-6, 26, 35, 51, 53, 77, 81-82, 103, 109-122, 223-225: Kosty
 - a. Second: Middleton
 - b. Vote: 6-0-0-1
 - c. Absent: Dundon

V. RECONSIDERATION

- a. Motion to close page(s) 102, 123-135, 229 (Large Garbage Bags, Medium Garbage Bags): Kosty
 - i. Second: Hotchkiss
 - ii. Vote: 6-0-0-1
 - iii. Absent: Dundon

Motion for a 5-minute recess: Mativetsky

Second: Middleton

All in Favor

- b. Motion to increase budget line A1010.54701. (Travel & Training) by \$1,050 and transfer \$1,050 from A1990.55000. (Contingency): Cavanaugh
 - i. Second: Middleton
 - ii. *Motion withdrawn by CM Cavanaugh*
- c. Motion to increase budget line A1010.54701. (Travel & Training) by \$1,700 and transfer \$1,700 from A1990.55000. (Contingency): Porter
 - i. Second: Middleton
 - ii. Vote: 6-0-0-1
 - iii. Absent: Dundon
- d. Motion to increase budget line A1010.54101. (Office Supplies) by \$1,000 and transfer \$1,000 from A1990.55000. (Contingency): Cavanaugh



LEGISLATIVE BRANCH ▪ CITY OF BINGHAMTON

Hadassah Mativetsky, City Council President

Sarah Dinhofer, City Clerk

- i. Second: Middleton
 - ii. Vote: 6-0-0-1
 - iii. Absent: Dundon
- e. Motion to close page(s) 16: Middleton
 - i. Second: Porter
 - ii. Vote: 6-0-0-1
 - iii. Absent: Dundon
- f. Motion to increase budget line A1410.51000. (Personal Services – *Licensing Clerk*) by \$40,000 and transfer \$40,000 from A1990.55000. (Contingency): Hotchkiss
 - i. *Motion withdrawn by CM Hotchkiss*
- g. Motion to increase budget line A1410.51000. (Personal Services – *Licensing Clerk*) by \$20,000 and transfer \$20,000 from A1990.55000. (Contingency): Hotchkiss
 - i. Second: Porter
 - ii. *CM Hotchkiss calls the question*
 - iii. Vote: 4-2-0-1
 - iv. Nay: Mativetsky, Kosty
 - v. Absent: Dundon
- h. Motion to increase budget line A4020.51000. (Personal Services – *Licensing Clerk*) by \$20,000 and transfer \$20,000 from A1990.55000. (Contingency): Hotchkiss
 - i. Second: Porter
 - ii. Vote: 5-1-0-1
 - iii. Nay: Kosty
 - iv. Absent: Dundon
- i. Motion to increase budget line A1410.54101 (Office Supplies) by \$500 and transfer \$500 from A1990.55000. (Contingency): Cavanaugh
 - i. Second: Porter
 - ii. Vote: 6-0-0-1
 - iii. Absent: Dundon
- j. Motion to close 27 *as amended*, 28, 76 *as amended*: Middleton
 - i. Second: Kosty
 - ii. Vote: 6-0-0-1
 - iii. Absent: Dundon
- k. Motion to reopen page(s) 51: Cavanaugh
 - i. Second: Middleton
 - ii. Vote: 6-0-0-1
 - iii. Absent: Dundon
- l. Motion to close page(s) 51: Cavanaugh
 - i. Second: Middleton
 - ii. *CM Hotchkiss calls the question*
 - iii. Vote: 6-0-0-1
 - iv. Absent: Dundon
- m. Motion to return \$50,000 to budget line M1910.54430. (Legal Services): Cavanaugh
 - i. Second: Hotchkiss
 - ii. Vote: 6-0-0-1
 - iii. Absent: Dundon



LEGISLATIVE BRANCH ▪ CITY OF BINGHAMTON

Hadassah Mativetsky, City Council President

Sarah Dinhofer, City Clerk

- n. Motion to decrease budget line A1420.54105. (Litigation/Arbitration Exp.) by \$35,000 and transfer \$35,000 to A1990.55000. (Contingency): Cavanaugh
 - i. Second: Hotchkiss
 - ii. Vote: 6-0-0-1
 - iii. Absent: Dundon
- o. Motion to decrease budget line A1420.54430. (Legal Services) by \$15,000 and transfer \$15,000 to A1990.55000. (Contingency): Cavanaugh
 - i. Second: Middleton
 - ii. *CM Hotchkiss calls the question*
 - iii. Vote: 6-0-0-1
 - iv. Absent: Dundon
- p. Motion to close page(s) 29-30: Kosty
 - i. Second: Porter
 - ii. *Second withdrawn by CM Porter*
- q. Motion to decrease budget line A1420.51000. (Personal Services) by \$20,000 for *Corporation Counsel*, \$15,000 for *1st Assistant Corporation Counsel*, \$3,000 for *Assistant Corp Counsel*, \$3,000 for *Asst. Attorney- Code Pros* and transfer \$41,000 to budget line A1990.55000. (Contingency) and increase budget line A1420.51000. (Personal Services) by \$1,000 for *Secretary to Corp Counsel*, \$2,740 for *Risk Assistant/Paralegal* and transfer \$3,740 from budget line A1990.55000. (Contingency): Cavanaugh
 - i. Second: Kosty
 - ii. *CM Kosty calls the question*
 - iii. Vote: 6-0-0-1
 - iv. Absent: Dundon
- r. Motion to close page(s) 29-30 *as amended*: Kosty
 - i. Second: Hotchkiss
 - ii. Vote: 6-0-0-1
 - iii. Absent: Dundon
- s. Motion to close page(s) 213-216: Kosty
 - i. Second: Middleton
 - ii. *CM Kosty calls the question*
 - iii. Vote: 6-0-0-1
 - iv. Absent: Dundon
- t. Motion to reopen page(s) 225: Hotchkiss
 - i. Second: Mativetsky
 - ii. Vote: 4-1-0-2
 - iii. Nay: Kosty
 - iv. Absent: Middleton, Dundon
- u. Motion to close page(s) 224: Kosty
 - i. Second: Mativetsky
 - ii. Vote: 6-0-0-1
 - iii. Absent: Dundon
- v. Motion to reopen page(s) 228 (Police): Cavanaugh
 - i. Second: Kosty
 - ii. Vote: 6-0-0-1



LEGISLATIVE BRANCH ▪ CITY OF BINGHAMTON

Hadassah Mativetsky, City Council President

Sarah Dinhofer, City Clerk

- iii. Absent: Dundon
- w. Motion to change Police fee for “Parking Meter Fees” to \$0.75 on page 228: Cavanaugh
 - i. Second: Kosty
 - ii. Vote: 6-0-0-1
 - iii. Absent: Dundon
- x. Motion to close Corporation Counsel fee for “Notary Fee”, Finance fee for “Comptroller’s Fees (roll to tax fee)”, Treasurer’s fee for “Returned Check Fee” on page 228: Cavanaugh
 - i. Second: Kosty
 - ii. Vote: 6-0-0-1
 - iii. Absent: Dundon
- y. Motion to close Vital Statistics fees for “Birth Certificate”, “Death Certificate”, “Genealogical Search” on page 229: Middleton
 - i. Second: Kosty
 - ii. Vote: 6-0-0-1
 - iii. Absent: Dundon
- z. Motion to close Refuse fee for “Materials” and Parks & Recreation fees on page 230: Cavanaugh
 - i. Second: Kosty
 - ii. Vote: 6-0-0-1
 - iii. Absent: Dundon
- aa. Motion to reopen page(s) 228 (Police): Hotchkiss
 - i. Second: *None*
- bb. Motion to close Fee Schedule on page(s) 227-234: Kosty
 - i. Second: Mativetsky
 - ii. Vote: 6-0-0-1
 - iii. Absent: Dundon

VI. ADJOURNMENT

Motioned at 11:38PM: Hotchkiss

Second: Mativetsky

All in Favor