



Department of Planning, Zoning, & Historic Preservation

SUMMARY OF MINUTES THE CITY OF BINGHAMTON THE COMMISSION ON ARCHITECTURE & URBAN DESIGN	
MEETING DATE: October 1, 2024	LOCATION: City Hall; 38 Hawley St, Binghamton, NY. 13901
CALLED TO ORDER: 12:15 p.m.	RECORDER OF MINUTES: Dylan Pelton

ROLL CALL		
COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:	PRESENT:	ABSENT:
J. Darrow (chair)	X	
M.E. Mauro	X	
D. Nead	X	
J. Weissberg	X	
D. Whalen	X	
B. Haas	X	
STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT:	TITLE & DEPARTMENT:	
J. Berling	Director, Planning Department	
S. Patel	City Planner, Planning Department	
D. Pelton	Historic Preservation Planner, Planning Department	
R. Heary	Corporate Council	

VOTING		
MOTION: To approve of the minutes from August 19.		
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: D. Nead	VOTE: (5-0-1)
AYE(S): B. Haas, D. Nead, J. Weissberg, M. E. Mauro, D. Whalen	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): J. Darrow

VOTING		
MOTION: To approve of the minutes from September.		
FIRST: D. Nead	SECOND: D. Whalen	VOTE: (5-0-1)
AYE(S): B. Haas, D. Nead, J. Weissberg, M. E. Mauro, D. Whalen	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): J. Darrow

BUSINESS ITEM	
ADDRESS: 39 Chenango Street	CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2024-36
DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA: The applicant, James Marotta, would like to install a sign on the front window of the building.	
Certificate of Appropriateness	
DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKING:	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Commissioner asks if it conforms to our guidelines for space and coverage. 	

- Staff replies that the sign coverage is 43% of the window and the historic district in Binghamton only allows for 33% or 1/3.
- Applicant states that the window is not 36 inches but rather 30 inches in height.
- Commissioner asks if that is 33% of the window.
- Staff replies that it is still over 33% of the window and if the sign were to only take up 1/3 of the window, the sign can only be 27 inches high.
- Commissioner states that the sign seems crowded and the applicant may want to simplify the sign by putting the information on two of the windows instead of one.
- Commissioner states that the applicant was at the last meeting and had privacy concerns over the space behind the glass on the first floor.
- Applicant states that the perforated vinyl window sign extends along the front and matches the colors on the next building over.
- Applicant also states that for safety concerns pedestrians should not be able to look into the building on the first floor.
- Commissioner states that the vinyl applications have been problematic in the past, but due to the privacy concerns, it is more appropriate in this context. However, the percentage of window coverage should be 33% of the window.

VOTING		
MOTION: To approve of the proposal as presented providing the window sign is 27 inches in height and the door sign is as presented being that it conforms to historic guidelines.		
FIRST: J. Weissberg	SECOND: J. Darrow	VOTE: (6-0-0)
AYE(S): D. Nead, M. E. Mauro, J. Weissberg, B. Hass, J. Darrow, D. Whalen	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None

BUSINESS ITEM	
ADDRESS: 81 Murray Street	CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2024-53
DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA: The applicant, Casey Dean, would like to demolish the accessory structure at 81 Murray Street.	
Determination of Historical Significance for Demolition	
DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKING:	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Applicant also states that the garage has been tarped and there is significant insect damage on the interior. • Applicant states that the garage is damaged and was close to being deemed unsafe, but could not due to the structures stability. • Commissioner states that a worker employed by the applicant lives in a property owned by him, but he does not think that would constitute a conflict of interest. • Council member agrees with that sentiment. 	

VOTING		
MOTION: To declare CAUD as lead agency.		
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: D. Nead	VOTE: (6-0-0)
AYE(S): J. Darrow, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None

VOTING		
MOTION: To declare demolition as an unlisted action.		
FIRST: D. Nead	SECOND: M. E. Mauro	VOTE: (6-0-0)
AYE(S): J. Darrow, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None

VOTING		
MOTION: To declare that the property is of No Historical Significance.		
FIRST: D. Nead	SECOND: J. Weissberg	VOTE: (6-0-0)
AYE(S): J. Darrow, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None

BUSINESS ITEM	
ADDRESS: 36 Chestnut Street	CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2024-52
DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA: The applicant, Casey Dean, would like to demolish the accessory structure at 36 Chestnut Street.	
Determination of Historical Significance for Demolition	
DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKING:	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Applicant also states that the garage was struck by a tree and sustained considerable damage. • Commissioner states that some of the old garages built during the 1920's and 30's had not only water faucets on the garages, but also gas hookups. Caution should be exercised during demolition. • Applicant states that there is approximately a foot of dirt pushed up against the south side of the garage leading to insect damage and water damage. 	

VOTING		
MOTION: To declare CAUD as lead agency.		
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: D. Nead	VOTE: (6-0-0)
AYE(S): J. Darrow, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None

VOTING		
MOTION: To declare demolition as an unlisted action.		
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: D. Nead	VOTE: (6-0-0)
AYE(S): J. Darrow, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None

VOTING		
MOTION: To declare that the property is of No Historical Significance.		
FIRST: J. Weissberg	SECOND: J. Darrow	VOTE: (6-0-0)
AYE(S): J. Darrow, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None

BUSINESS ITEM	
ADDRESS: 193 Matthews Street	CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2024-45
DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA: The applicant, the City of Binghamton, would like to demolish the structure located at 193 Matthews Street.	
Determination of Historical Significance for Demolition	
DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKING:	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Applicant states that the structure located at that address is not the primary structure, but rather an accessory structure to a mansion located on Main Street. Commissioner points out that the brackets on the third floor of the original razed structure are actually over 200 individually carved faces around the mansion. Commissioner states that the building has gone through several phases of renovation, sustained at least one fire, and is likely at the end of it's lifespan. Speaker is a local resident, Giovanni Scaringi, 189 Matthews Street. Speaker states that the building has had not one, but two fires, both drug related. Speaker also states that the building has not been occupied in over 8 years and is not worth renovating. 	

VOTING		
MOTION: To declare CAUD as lead agency.		
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: J. Weissberg	VOTE: (6-0-0)
AYE(S): J. Darrow, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None

VOTING		
MOTION: To declare demolition as an unlisted action.		
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: D. Nead	VOTE: (6-0-0)
AYE(S): J. Darrow, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None

VOTING		
MOTION: To declare that the property is of No Historical Significance.		
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: J. Weissberg	VOTE: (6-0-0)
AYE(S): J. Darrow, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None

- Speaker Giovanni Scaringi states that he is pleased with the discussion and handling of the property.

BUSINESS ITEM	
ADDRESS: 182 Hawley Street	CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2024-50
DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA: The applicant, the City of Binghamton, would like to demolish the structure located at 182 Hawley Street	

Determination of Historical Significance for Demolition

DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKING:

- Commissioner states that he has a problem with this building coming down related to the historical significance of the structure.
- Commissioner states that he sees this building as a salvageable property for the city.
- Applicant (Staff) states that the building will be visited by a structural engineer tomorrow and an assessment will be given based on the economic viability and structural integrity of the building.
- Applicant states that although the previous owner took all of the interior walls and materials out of the house, the framing seemed salvageable and the structure may be useful.
- Commissioner states that from a developer’s standpoint, that is a positive step being that all the interior of the building would have to be demolished anyway to make the interior up to current code.
- Applicant states that it was noted that a load bearing wall was removed, but the wall was in the attic supporting the roof and could easily be replaced without changing the structural integrity of the building.
- Commissioner states that the building used to have a tower in the front that was removed a long time ago.
- Commissioner motions to table the decision until the engineering report is issued.

VOTING

MOTION: To table the discussion of the historical significance of the building until the engineering report is concluded.

FIRST: J. Darrow

SECOND: M. E. Mauro

VOTE: (6-0-0)

AYE(S): J. Darrow, J. Weissberg, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, B. Haas

NAY(S): None

ABSTENTION(S): None

- Other Business
 - Staff states that in considering signage in historic districts, it is also important to consider the city charter’s regulations as they have to be adhered to as well.
 - Commissioner states that the building at 188 Court Street should not be torn down.
 - Commissioner states that the iron fence on 89 Walnut Street is in disrepair and the masonry wall on the Mather Street side needs to be rebuilt.
 - Commissioner states that the next meeting is election day and asks if there are any conflicts resulting.
 - There are none, the meeting will be held November 5th.

VOTING

MOTION: To adjourn the September 3rd CAUD commission meeting.

FIRST: J. Darrow

SECOND: D. Nead

VOTE: (6-0-0)

AYE(S): J. Darrow, B. Haas, D. Nead, D. Whalen, M. E. Mauro, J. Weissberg

NAY(S): None

ABSTENTION(S): None