



Planning, Zoning & Historic Preservation

Mayor Jared M. Kraham

Dr. Juliet Berling, Director
Tito L. Martinez, Assistant Director

SUMMARY OF MINUTES THE CITY OF BINGHAMTON THE COMMISSION ON ARCHITECTURE & URBAN DESIGN	
MEETING DATE: June 6, 2023	LOCATION: City Hall; 38 Hawley St, Binghamton, NY. 13901
CALLED TO ORDER: 12:19 p.m.	RECORDER OF MINUTES: Dylan Pelton

ROLL CALL		
COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:	PRESENT:	ABSENT:
K. Ellsworth (chair)		X
M.E. Mauro	X	
M. Lombardini		X
D. Nead	X	
R. Heary	X	
D. Whalen	X	
J. Darrow	X	
STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT:	TITLE & DEPARTMENT:	
J. Berling	Director, Planning Department	
S. Patel	City Planner, Planning Department	
D. Pelton	Historic Preservation Planner, Planning Department	
P. McGinnis	Commissioner of Parks & Recreation	

APPROVAL OF MINUTES		
Motion: to Approve April 4, 2023 CAUD meeting minutes.		
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: D. Nead	VOTE: (4-0-1)
AYE(S): D. Whalen, R. Heary	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): M.E. Mauro
Motion: To approve May 2, 2023 CAUD meeting Minutes.		
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: D. Nead	VOTE: (4-0-1)
AYE(S): D. Whalen, R. Heary	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): M.E. Mauro

BUSINESS ITEM	
ADDRESS: 33 West State Street	CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2023-15
DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA: The City of Binghamton intends to acquire and demolish the structures and pavement on the site for the following purposes: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • expansion of the City’s existing and adjacent Cheri Lindsey Park located at the northern portion of the proposed site by approximately 2.25 acres to provide for additional and enhanced facilities, amenities, and open space. 	

- Improving public access to the existing and adjacent multi-use River Walk located along the eastern bank of the Chenango River and at the western portion of the proposed site, together with related improvements constituting approximately 9.5 acres
- Clearing and preparation of the remaining 12.45 acres of the site along W State Street for an as yet undetermined productive use, most likely involving a mix of commercial and residential uses.

Determination of Significance for Demolition

DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKING:

- Staff presented the application.
- Sara Glose represented The City of Binghamton for the CAUD presentation.
- City of Binghamton asked for the option to demolish the buildings at 33 W. State St. following eminent domain proceedings.
- Motion from the CAUD council would not require the City of Binghamton to demolish the buildings, but rather set the stage for that option going forward.
- Commissioned asked for discussion, or motion, relating to the demolition of the buildings at 33 W. State Street.

VOTING

MOTION: To approve as presented and to proceed with the prospect of further investigation and a final determination for the property located at 33 West State Street, the old Binghamton Plaza property.

FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: M.E. Mauro	VOTE: (5-0-0)
AYE(S): R. Heary, D. Nead, D. Whalen	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None

BUSINESS ITEM

ADDRESS: 10 Moore Avenue	CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2023-19
---------------------------------	----------------------------------

DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA: The applicant, Emily Wall, would like to demolish the accessory garage structure in her backyard.

Determination of Significance for Demolition

DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKING:

- Staff presented the application.
- Applicant could not be present as she recently had a newborn, but she was present on the phone.
- Commissioner asked what applicant would do with the space once the structure was removed.
- Applicant replied, "We would eventually like to put up another garage."

VOTING

MOTION: To declare CAUD lead agency and rule it as an unlisted action.

FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: M.E. Mauro	VOTE: (5-0-0)
AYE(S): R. Heary, D. Nead, D. Whalen	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None

Motion: Structure is of No Historical Significance.

FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: M.E. Mauro	VOTE: (5-0-0)
AYE(S): R. Heary, D. Nead, D. Whalen	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None

BUSINESS ITEM

ADDRESS: 24 Munsell Street	CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2023-17
-----------------------------------	----------------------------------

DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA:		
DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA: The applicant, Sandra Rampa, would like to demolish an accessory structure on the back of the property. The structure was a residency at one time.		
Determination of Significance for Demolition		
DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKING:		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Staff presented the application. • Commissioner, “ Doesn’t have much of a roof.” • Commissioner asked if she was planning on making it a parking lot. • Applicant was not. 		
VOTING		
MOTION: To approve of demolition of rear structure at 24 Munsell Street.		
FIRST: D. Nead	SECOND: D. Whalen	VOTE: PASSED (5-0-0)
AYE(S): R. Heary, M.E. Mauro, J. Darrow	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None
MOTION: To declare demolition as an unlisted action.		
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: D. Nead	VOTE: PASSED (5-0-0)
AYE(S): R. Heary, M.E. Mauro, D. Whalen	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None
MOTION: To declare CAUD as lead agency.		
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: D. Whalen	VOTE: PASSED (5-0-0)
AYE(S): R. Heary, M.E. Mauro, D. Nead	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None
MOTION: To declare building is of No Historical Significance.		
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: R. Heary	VOTE: PASSED (5-0-0)
AYE(S): D. Whalen, M.E. Mauro, D. Nead	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None

BUSINESS ITEM		
ADDRESS: 5 Murray Street	CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2023-14	
DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA: The applicant, Evelyn Mayer, would like to replace existing original windows with more energy efficient windows. Prior modifications are not sufficient for energy conservation.		
Certificate of Appropriateness		
DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKING:		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Staff presented the application. • Staff pointed out that the windows presented are not the same as the ones being installed. • The windows being installed are 1 over 1 windows, the same that are currently on the house. • The windows that are on the top story are 9 over 1, they must remain in that configuration. • Commissioner, “Even the ones in the back.” • Commissioner, “They do make fret work inserts to install on the interior of the window, that would be okay.” 		
VOTING		
MOTION: To approve of the new 1 over 1 windows and either the 9 over 1 upper story windows, or an insert for the appearance of a 9 over 1 window.		
FIRST: R. Heary	SECOND: M.E. Mauro	VOTE: (5-0-0)
AYE(S): J. Darrow, D. Nead, D. Whalen	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None

BUSINESS ITEM		
ADDRESS: 22 Front Street		CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2023-18
DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA: The applicant, Discoveries in Sculpture Inc., would like to install aluminum storm windows on the first floor of the building over existing windows. They would also like to repair the decayed clapboard on the North exterior as well as replace damaged fascia and crown molding at upper roof perimeter with matching materials "in kind".		
Certificate of Appropriateness		
DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKING:		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Staff presented the application. • Commissioner asked if there were preexisting storm windows on the first floor. • Applicant responded that he did not think there ever was. • Staff asked if second story storm widows were white. • Applicant replied they were and his intention is to match the windows already installed on second story. 		
VOTING		
MOTION: To approve installation of aluminum storm windows on the first floor of the building over existing windows and repairs to the clapboard on the North exterior as well as replace damaged fascia and crown molding at upper roof perimeter with matching materials "in kind".		
FIRST: D. Whalen	SECOND: J. Darrow	VOTE: (5-0-0)
AYE(S): M.E. Mauro, D. Nead, R. Heary	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None

BUSINESS ITEM		
ADDRESS: 186 State Street		CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2023-20
DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA: The applicant, Stephanie Brewer, Broome County Planning Department, has proposed a mural to be painted along the façade of 186 State Street. The proposed project will make repairs/improvements to the north and front/primary facades as well.		
Certificate of Appropriateness		
DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKING:		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Staff presented the application. • Applicant is from Broome County Planning office. • Part of a grant given in 2019 for mural in the Southern Tier area. • The county has previously had 5 such murals approved. • Applicant states the mural would add visual interest and support the city's goal of becoming an arts destination area. • The original design was approved 2021, but a new artist was chosen known as "Starfighter A". • The mural would be the same size as the original mural that was proposed. • Mural would be painted on the North side of the building facing Chris's Diner. • Façade improvements are part of the application and would be necessary for the building to accept the paint used for the mural. 		
VOTING		
MOTION: To approve of the mural and the repairs needed for the addition of the mural at 186 State Street as presented.		
FIRST: D. Nead	SECOND: R. Heary	VOTE: (5-0-0)
AYE(S): M.E. Mauro, J. Darrow, D. Whalen	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None

BUSINESS ITEM		
ADDRESS: 103 Laurel Avenue		CASE NUMBER: CAUD-2023-16
DESCRIPTION FROM AGENDA: The applicant, Nicholas Parisi, would like to place a six-foot-high bronze statue of Rod Serling standing in front of a doorway engraved with the words, "You unlock this door with the key of imagination." The statue will stand on a base engraved with relevant dates and information from his career.		
Certificate of Appropriateness		
DISCUSSION POINTS & THOSE SPEAKING:		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Staff presented the application. • Commissioner, "Do we know what the base is at this point?" • Applicant, "It will be 40" wide, 28" deep and 18" tall." • Each side will have a different inscription with different aspects of his life, but the exact language for the base has not been chosen. • The statue will be posed in the middle of a doorframe inscribed with the words, "You open this door with the key of imagination." • The exact material for the base has not been selected yet. • The commission can approve of the statue with the information provided, but pictures and a more complete description must be given for the base of the statue. • Staff asked for considerations about where the statue is to be placed after it is finished. • Commissioner of Parks and Recreation pointed to two locations in the park, one at the top where an old flagpole was removed and in the park within a triangle portion between the bandstand and the carousel. • Commissioner asked if it could be somewhere in the bandstand, but the it would limit the area of the bandstand and ultimately take up too much room. 		
VOTING		
MOTION: To approve of the statue with the open angle doorframe and the reprised face as the "face" of the statue as presented in Recreation Park.		
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: D. Nead	VOTE: (5-0-0)
AYE(S): M.E. Mauro, R. Heary, D. Whalen	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None
VOTING		
MOTION: To preliminarily approval of base pending final presentation to the commission of the final rendition of the base of the statue.		
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: D. Whalen	VOTE: (5-0-0)
AYE(S): M.E. Mauro, D. Nead, R. Heary	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None
Commissioner: Could I ask for a preliminary vote as to where each of the commissioners would like the statue?		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • M.E. Mauro: Within the Park b/w bandstand and carousel • D. Nead: Above near Johnson statue • R. Heary: Above near Johnson statue • D. Whalen: Above near Johnson statue • J. Darrow: Within the Park b/w bandstand and carousel 		
VOTING		
MOTION: To table placement until we have specifications on final statue, we will pick a final location for the monument at that time.		
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: D. Nead	VOTE: (5-0-0)
AYE(S): M.E. Mauro, R. Heary, D. Whalen	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None

ADJOURNMENT

Motion to adjourn.		TIME: 1:07 PM
FIRST: J. Darrow	SECOND: D. Nead	VOTE: (5-0-0)
AYE(S): R. Heary, D. Whalen, M.E. Mauro	NAY(S): None	ABSTENTION(S): None